



**Legislative Assembly  
Province of Alberta**

No. 38

## **VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

Fourth Session

Twenty-Fourth Legislature

---

---

Tuesday, May 9, 2000

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

### **Presenting Petitions**

Mr. Mr. Lougheed, Hon. Member for Clover Bar-Fort Saskatchewan, presented a petition from 291 Albertans supporting the reinstatement of front licence plates on all vehicles registered in Alberta.

Mr. Langevin, Hon. Member for Lac La Biche-St. Paul, presented a petition from 210 Albertans supporting the reinstatement of front licence plates on all vehicles registered in Alberta.

Mr. Thurber, Hon. Member for Drayton Valley-Calmar, presented a petition from 88 Albertans supporting the reinstatement of front licence plates on all vehicles registered in Alberta.

Mr. Jacques, Hon. Member for Grande Prairie-Wapiti, presented a petition from 280 Albertans supporting the reinstatement of front licence plates on all vehicles registered in Alberta.

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, presented a petition from 172 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, presented a petition from 140 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry, presented a petition from 141 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, presented a petition from 223 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Nicol, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East, presented a petition from 49 Lethbridge residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, presented a petition from 135 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, presented a petition from 76 Edmonton residents urging the Government to ensure long-term care access is available within the public system.

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, presented a petition from 37 Edmonton residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, presented a petition from 136 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Calder, presented a petition from 216 Edmonton and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, presented a petition from 152 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods, presented a petition from 107 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, presented a petition from 137 Albertans requesting that public health care be protected, supported and enhanced, and that for-profit, private hospitals be banned from receiving public dollars.

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, presented a petition from 24 Calgary residents requesting that the Government use its legislative powers to help resolve the labour dispute at the Calgary Herald.

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, presented a petition from 146 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, presented a petition from 124 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, presented a petition from 324 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 201 Albertans urging the Government to maintain Kananaskis in a natural state, deny development approval to any intensive recreational developments, and create a Wildland Provincial Park.

### **Reading and Receiving Petitions**

On request by Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned, petition the Assembly to urge the Government to use its legislative powers to help resolve the labour dispute at the Calgary Herald.

On request by Dr. Nicol, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to introduce legislation requiring a minimum of two people on shifts from dark to daylight.

On request by Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned, petition the Assembly to urge the Government to use its legislative powers to help resolve the labour dispute at the Calgary Herald.

On request by Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of the Province of Alberta, hereby petition the Legislative Assembly to pass a bill banning private for-profit hospitals in Alberta so that the integrity of the public, universal health care system may be maintained.

## **Notices of Motions**

Pursuant to Standing Order 34(2)(a), Mr. Zwozdesky, Deputy Government House Leader, gave oral notice of the following Written Questions and Motions for Returns to be dealt with Wednesday, May 10, 2000:

Written Questions: Stand and retain their places.

Motions for Returns: MR33, MR34, MR35, MR40, MR44, MR45, MR48, MR49.

## **Tabling Returns and Reports**

Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier:

Letter dated May 9, 2000, from Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, to The Right Honourable Jean Chrétien, Prime Minister, advising the Prime Minister of the Government amendments to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 860/2000

Hon. Ms Evans, Minister of Children's Services:

Response to Written Question WQ17 asked for by Mrs. Soetaert on behalf of Mrs. Sloan on May 3, 2000:

How many children with Child Welfare status have been housed in hotel rooms in the Edmonton region between February 18, 1999 and April 5, 2000?

Sessional Paper 861/2000

Response to Written Question WQ18 asked for by Mrs. Soetaert on behalf of Mrs. Sloan on May 3, 2000:

How many children with Child Welfare status have been housed in jail cells, remand centres, or single men's hostels between February 18, 1999 and April 5, 2000 in the Province?

Sessional Paper 862/2000

Response to Written Question WQ19 asked for by Mrs. Soetaert on behalf of Mrs. Sloan on May 3, 2000:

In which hotels in the Edmonton region were children who were receiving services under the Child Welfare Act housed in between February 18, 1999 and April 5, 2000?

Sessional Paper 863/2000

Response to Written Question WQ20 asked for by Mrs. Soetaert on behalf of Mrs. Sloan on May 3, 2000:

What are the reasons for appeal and breakdown of decisions reached in the 485 appeals heard by the Child Welfare Citizen's Appeal Panel during the 1998-99 fiscal year?

Sessional Paper 864/2000

Hon. Dr. West, Acting Provincial Treasurer:

Responses to questions raised on March 6, 2000, Department of Treasury, 2000-2001 Budget estimates consideration by Committee of Supply

Sessional Paper 865/2000

Hon. Mr. Hancock, Minister of Justice and Attorney General:

Response to Written Question WQ16 asked for by Ms Blakeman on April 19, 2000:

How many agreements is the Department of Justice and Attorney General currently negotiating with other jurisdictions pursuant to the Reciprocal Enforcement of Maintenance Orders Act?

Sessional Paper 866/2000

Mrs. Burgener, Hon. Member for Calgary-Currie:

Information pamphlet entitled "Manifesto 2000, For a culture of peace and non-violence" prepared by UNESCO (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization)

Sessional Paper 867/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

2 letters, one undated, from Marie Lars, Edmonton, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, and one dated April 17, 2000, from Dorothy Corney, Red Deer, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, The Right Honourable Jean Chrétien, Prime Minister, and Hon. Allan Rock, Federal Minister of Health, both raising questions regarding, and expressing opposition to, Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act and the public health care system

Sessional Paper 868/2000

Letter dated March 26, 2000, from Gerry Shaw, President, Senior Alpine Ski Club, Calgary, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, opposing the Genesis Land Development Corporation proposed development to the Spray Lakes area in Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 869/2000

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford:

E-mail message dated May 5, 2000, from John O. Olsen, Camrose, to Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, expressing concerns regarding Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, and asking Mr. Wickman to vote against it

Sessional Paper 870/2000

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark:

NetNews Inc. web page article dated May 8, 2000, entitled "Story Two: The Numbers Game" written by Donna Korchinski, summarizing stories on Calgary Laboratory Services (CLS)

Sessional Paper 871/2000

NetNews Inc. web page news release, undated, entitled "Health Minister confirms that CLS (Calgary Laboratory Services) has 'outstanding issues'"

Sessional Paper 872/2000

Press release dated May 5, 2000, entitled "Liberal candidate says Health Minister is avoiding responsibility" with attached April 20, 2000 Hansard excerpt and letter dated May 5, 2000, from Mr. Robinson to Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, regarding surgery waiting lists in the Mistahia Health Region, prepared by Barry Robinson, Alberta Liberal candidate, Grande Prairie-Smoky constituency

Sessional Paper 873/2000

International Express article, undated, entitled "£60,000 for doctors if they rejoin NHS (National Health Service)"

Sessional Paper 874/2000

Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition:

Letter dated April 24, 2000, from Dorothy Almas, Edmonton, unaddressed, regarding a minimum 12-week wait to receive radiation treatments at the W.W. Cross Cancer Institute

Sessional Paper 875/2000

Letter dated May 8, 2000, from David King, Edmonton, to the Editor, Edmonton Journal, expressing concerns regarding, and opposition to, Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, and stating that he will ask constituents of Members of the Legislative Assembly who vote for Bill 11 to elect a new government

Sessional Paper 876/2000

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview:

Letter dated April 26, 2000, from Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, to Hon. Ms Evans, Minister of Children's Services, requesting information relating to the Department of Children's Services and Child Welfare's acts and omissions in the placement of Corvette Crier

Sessional Paper 877/2000

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora:

Document dated May 9, 2000, entitled "Calculating your taxes under the 10.5% Klein Flat Tax, 2004" showing calculations of provincial tax payable for a range of incomes at current and proposed tax rates

Sessional Paper 878/2000

Petition signed by 20 Albertans opposing the privatization of health care and private for-profit services, and requesting that funding be restored to public health care to reduce long waiting lists

Sessional Paper 879/2000

Document, undated, signed by 40 Albertans, entitled "A Message to Ralph Klein" protesting the content of, and intention to legislate, Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 880/2000

Letter dated May 9, 2000, from Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, to Carl Roy, President, Caritas Health Group, Edmonton, clarifying a misunderstanding arising from a St. Albert public meeting, and apologizing to Mr. Roy for not referring to him by his proper title

Sessional Paper 881/2000

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo:

Web page dated May 5, 2000, from misterpoll.com showing poll results for the question "Should the Government of Alberta pass Bill 11?"

Sessional Paper 882/2000

E-mail message dated April 13, 2000, from Cinda Chavich, striking Calgary Herald worker, to Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, urging the Government to use its legislative powers to assist striking Calgary Herald workers in obtaining their first collective agreement

Sessional Paper 883/2000

Report, undated, entitled "Our Chosen Land, 100 years of development of the Chinese community" published by the Calgary Chinese Cultural Centre

Sessional Paper 884/2000

Report dated April 1999, entitled "Privacy and Confidentiality of Health Information at CIHI (Canadian Institute for Health Information): Principles and policies for the protection of health information" prepared by the Canadian Institute for Health Information

Sessional Paper 885/2000

Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Calder:

Tabulation of responses, as of April 14, 2000, to a questionnaire on health care put to constituents of the Edmonton-Calder constituency

Sessional Paper 886/2000

Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods:

Report, undated, entitled "Medical Errors Higher at For-Profit than Not-for-Profit Hospitals, Harvard Study Finds" prepared by Physicians for a National Health System (PNHP), Chicago, Illinois

Sessional Paper 887/2000

Newspaper dated May 2000, entitled "The Asian Times" featuring citizens from Edmonton-Mill Creek on the steps of the Legislature saying no to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 888/2000

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre:

Letter dated April 27, 2000, from Sheila McKay, Board President, Central Alberta Women's Emergency Shelter, Red Deer, to Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, requesting that Ms Blakeman continue her efforts in assisting to ensure funding is continued for the Batterers' Treatment Program in Red Deer

Sessional Paper 889/2000

## **Oral Question Period**

During Oral Question Period, Mr. Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, tabled the following:

Calgary Herald article dated May 4, 2000, entitled "Federal Liberals poised for record in stifling debate"

Sessional Paper 890/2000



## **Members' Statements**

Mrs. Burgener, Hon. Member for Calgary-Currie, made a statement regarding the year 2000 being proclaimed the International Year for the Culture of Peace by the United Nations General Assembly, and a document entitled "Manifesto 2000" drafted on the 50th anniversary of the United Nations universal declaration of human rights, expected to be signed by 100 million people, to be presented to the United Nations General Assembly in September 2000 as part of the International Day of Peace.

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, made a statement regarding the state of democracy in Alberta, particularly regarding the debate on Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, and commented on the importance in a democracy of listening to and supporting alternative points of view.

Mr. Johnson, Hon. Member for Wetaskiwin-Camrose, made a statement regarding the year 2000 inductees to the Aviation Hall of Fame located in Wetaskiwin, namely James Tocher-Baine, who will be posthumously inducted, Albert Baker, Paul Bernard Dilworth, Reginald John Laine, and Vera Elsie Strodel-Dowling, to be inducted at a ceremony on May 13, 2000, at the Reynolds-Alberta Museum, as well as the Royal Canadian Mounted Police air division, which will be awarded the year 2000 Val Devorian Award of Excellence.

## **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

### **Public Bills and Orders Other Than Government Bills and Orders**

#### **Second Reading**

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 208 Gaming and Liquor Amendment Act, 2000 — Mrs. MacBeth

A debate followed.

Pursuant to Standing Order 8(2)(b), debate adjourned, Mr. Wickman speaking.

### **Motions Other Than Government Motions**

**509.** Moved by Mr. Lougheed:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly urge the Government to reinstate the requirement to display front licence plates on all vehicles registered in the province.

Debate continued on the amendment moved by Mr. Tannas on May 2, 2000, which reads as follows:

Mr. Tannas, Hon. Member for Highwood, moved the motion be amended by adding the following after “province”:

“in conjunction with a licence plate re-issue”

The question being put, the amendment was agreed to.

The question being put, the motion as amended was agreed to.

**510.** Moved by Ms Olsen:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly urge the Government to establish a special task force in conjunction with federal and municipal authorities to examine ways to preserve neighbourhoods affected by school closures and business relocations.

A debate followed.

Pursuant to Standing Order 8(2)(c), debate adjourned, Mr. Amery speaking.

### **Government Bills and Orders**

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Third time:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act - Hon. Mr. Jonson

Debate continued on the motion for the previous question.

Pursuant to Standing Order 4(1), debate adjourned on the motion for the previous question, Mr. White speaking.

### **Adjournment**

The Assembly adjourned at 5:30 p.m. until 8:00 p.m.

TUESDAY, MAY 9, 2000 — 8:00 P.M.

### **Government Bills and Orders**

#### **Third Reading**

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Third time:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act - Hon. Mr. Jonson

Debate continued on the motion for the previous question.

During debate, Hon. Mr. Paszkowski, Minister of Municipal Affairs, tabled the following:

Web page article from Norway, regarding support by Hon. Tore Tonne, Norwegian Minister of Health, for utilizing private resources in the health system  
Sessional Paper 891/2000

National Post article dated May 1, 2000, entitled "Romanow's revolution" regarding the Saskatchewan Health Facilities Licensing Act  
Sessional Paper 892/2000

During debate, Mr. Coutts, Hon. Member for Livingstone-Macleod, tabled the following:

Document entitled "Bill 11 is a necessary step in ensuring the protection of the public health care system in Alberta" prepared by Teresa Welsch  
Sessional Paper 893/2000

Mr. Melchin moved adjournment of the debate on the motion for the previous question, which was agreed to.

### **Adjournment**

On motion by Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 11:53 p.m. until Wednesday, May 10, 2000, at 1:30 p.m.

---

---

Hon. Ken Kowalski,  
Speaker

Title: Tuesday, May 9, 2000